

CROWE VALLEY CONSERVATION AUTHORITY

FULL AUTHORITY

MINUTES

25 October 2013 (Held at Marmora Town Hall)

MEMBERS PRESENT

Robert Stiles	Stirling-Rawdon Township
Sandy Fraser	Municipality of Marmora and Lake
Brent Goodwin	Wollaston Township
Barry Rand	North Kawartha
Suzanne Partridge	Municipality of Highlands East
Ron Gerow	Havelock-Belmont-Methuen Townships
Gerald Phillips	Tudor & Cashel Township
Sharon Carson	Limerick Township
Dennis Purcell	Faraday Township
Hector Macmillan	Municipality of Trent Hills

MEMBERS ABSENT

None.

ALSO PRESENT

Janice Maynard	Chair, Quinte Conservation Board
Terry Murphy	General Manager, Quinte Conservation
Mark Holt	Community Press
Judy Backus	EMC
Tim Pidduck	General Manager/Secretary Treasurer, CVCA
Amanda Donald	Recording Secretary, CVCA
Members of the Public	

WELCOME

The Chair, Barry Rand, welcomed the public to the meeting. He introduced the Board, Terry Murphy, Janice Maynard, Tim Pidduck, Sharlene Richardson and Amanda Donald to the public. He stated that the primary concern for today's meeting is to obtain input from the public with regards to the Quinte Conservation (QC) proposal that the Board is currently considering. The Chair emphasized he would allow each speaker five minutes for their presentation and/or questions.

CALL TO ORDER

The Chair, Barry Rand, called the meeting to order at 10:02am.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

FA Motion G 74/13

Moved by: Dennis Purcell

Seconded by: Gerald Phillips

That the agenda be approved as circulated.

Carried.

DECLARATION OF PECUNIARY INTEREST:

There were no conflicts to declare.

REVIEW OF THE MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

FA Motion G 75/13

Moved by: Ron Gerow

Seconded: Sharon Carson

That the 19 September 2013 minutes be approved, as circulated.

Carried

BUSINESS ARISING FROM MINUTES

None.

CORRESPONDENCE

None.

REPORT ON TCC MEETING – RON GEROW

Chair Rand referred to one of the letters that was provided to the Board at the previous meeting from the managers of the Trent Conservation Coalition (TCC) and subsequently asked Ron Gerow for an update for the TCC Meeting. Ron Gerow, Chair of the Strategic Alternatives Sub-committee, stated that the meeting between the sub-committee and the Managers of the TCC occurred on 9 October 2013. They discussed previous endeavors that the CVCA and the TCC group have worked on together. The sub-committee did offer the TCC group the opportunity to make a proposal similar to the Quinte Conservation (QC) proposal, but the group declined the offer. However the Managers of the TCC offered support independently to the CVCA. The Managers of the TCC have offered to help the CVCA in any way they can in the future.

Barry apologized for skipping agenda item 8, the Long Range Plan update.

LONG RANGE PLAN UPDATE

Barry Rand informed everyone that he was the Chair of the Long Range Planning Committee that was struck in 2012 to develop the Long Range Plan (LRP) a ten year plan for the CVCA.

Tim Pidduck updated the Board on progress made on the LRP. Not everything has been completed, but staff are making significant progress. The health and safety projects are well under way at Belmont, Wollaston and Marmora Dams. The safety booms have been installed at all three dams and the tenders for the overhead gantry systems should be finalized soon. Mike Whiltshire, a local Marmora resident, has been hired to provide the Authority's IT support. Mike has started the process of getting the Authority a server and has made himself available on an as needed basis.

The new Generic Regulations Officer, Sharlene Richardson, has now been employed at the Authority for almost a year and has made significant strides to improve the generic regulations program.

Barry mentioned that the Executive Summary of the LRP was included in the agenda package for this meeting. He stated that there are many challenges at every organization and the Board pursued the option to enter into a services agreement with QC to find efficient ways to run the Authority.

PRESENTATION OF QUINTE PROPOSAL – RON GEROW & TERRY MURPHY

Terry Murphy introduced himself to everyone as the General Manager of the Quinte Conservation Authority. QC is made up of three CAs that decided to amalgamate because they could no longer afford to offer efficient services as separate organizations. QC employs two engineers, a hydrogeologist, health and safety staff and an ecologist as well as many other staff personnel. They have a team approach on many issues. The only difference between CVCA's regulations program and QC's is that QC staff are able to consult engineers and hydrogeologists as needed. Terry reviewed how he was approached by the sub-committee and how the proposal became what it is today. QC staff did have meetings with CVCA staff to discuss the difference between their duties and have toured all the CVCA dams. Terry informed everyone that QC currently manages 40 dams in their watershed.

Terry reviewed some of the concerns that he has heard about the proposal. He has heard a major concern over the distance, however the current QC watershed goes almost all the way to Sharbot Lake, which is a two hour drive. He stated that it is a long way, but it is manageable. QC staff currently deal with one section of the watershed per day to make the distance more manageable. QC also has a sub office in Tweed which currently has three staff.

Terry stated that the QC Board is still willing to continue with the proposal to help the CVCA if the Board decides to continue down this road.

Ron Gerow stated that it has been a lengthy process and thanks QC for their perseverance. He stated that he realizes that it has been difficult for the CVCA staff and there needs to be some heartfelt decisions made. Today's meeting is crucial to the stakeholders and the Board of the CVCA in the decision making process.

PUBLIC INQUIRIES & CLARIFICATION

Dave Daunter was among the first members of public to speak to the Board. He distributed a letter to the Board. Dave mentioned to the Board that their constituents trust them to make the right decision and in his opinion, if the Board decides to approve the current proposal, they would not be acting in the best interest of the Authority or the public. Dave stated that his aim is to convince members of the Board who are not certain which way to vote and who have not been intimidated by other members of the Board or their municipal councils. Dave raised many issues including infrastructure concerns, health and safety concerns to both staff and the general public and conservations area lands. He stated that without significant levy increases, these concerns of the Board and the public will never be resolved. Several past General Managers of the Authority have stated that it is next to impossible to obtain the necessary levy increases for the operations and capital expenditures of the CVCA.

Chair Rand reminded Mr. Daunter of the time limit.

Dave briefly reviewed the levy amounts for Marmora and Lake and Havelock-Belmont-Methuen (HBM) for 2012 and 2013 and the minute increases that each tax payer paid for 2013. Dave thinks that the Board members are taking too much advice from their Reeves, Mayors and Councils. This Board needs to come together and work as a team to improve the deficiencies at CVCA.

Barry reminded Dave of the time limit again.

Dave asked for a recorded vote and distributed a copy of his presentation to the Board.

Ritch Smith of the Crowe Lake Waterway Association (CLWA) was next to address the Board. He informed the Board that the CLWA has two hundred members, both permanent and seasonal residents. The organization became interested in the CVCA's financial problems in 2011 when the CVCA Board started discussing budgetary issues. His primary concern is the deteriorating infrastructure. He expressed his concern over the lack of communication between CVCA and property owners. He feels that bigger is better and that CVCA is not big enough to cut it in this economic environment. QC has many resources that would be helpful to the property owners throughout the watershed.

Dave Golem, Reeve of Limerick Township, commended the Board for looking so closely at the proposal that is being presented to them. He expressed concern over some of the capital expenditures in the comparison between the LRP and the QC proposal. He doesn't feel the Board has been provided with enough information to make an informed decision. Barry Rand replied to Dave that the only difference in the capital expenditures is due to disposing of the CVCA Administrative Building.

Bob Allen, president of Shaman Power Corporation introduced himself to the Board. He thinks that QC is a responsible organization but is unsure if they will be able to achieve everything in the proposal. His company has had a long term contract with the CVCA to operate and maintain the Marmora Hydro Plant. His concerns with the proposal include timing of support, log operations and maintenance. He has nothing but good things to say about the services provided by the staff of the CVCA. He would like to see the same level of service maintained and informed the Board of a letter he has written to Chair Rand expressing all of his concerns.

Fred Quarrie introduced himself to the Board. He stated that in the proposal it says that the CVCA Board will remain intact and the Board will still have to pay insurance costs. He feels that the CVCA Board will have all the liability and will have no control over the operations throughout the watershed if the proposal is approved. Hector Macmillan responded by saying that the Board will still have all the control over the operations. It would be just like hiring a contractor to do the work for you and QC would be the contractor in this case.

Kathy Hamilton introduced herself as a resident of Cameron Street, one of the most flood prone areas in the CVCA watershed. She states that the proposal reads like a takeover rather than a services agreement. She would like to see continued excellent service with the well-respected, long standing employees of the CVCA. She feels this is despicable treatment of the current staff and it publicly questions the Boards integrity. She feels that the sub-committee has made a commitment without public awareness and it is very demoralizing to both CVCA staff and the public. The only people who will benefit from this proposal is the QC and its staff and aren't QC's hands and coffers full enough? She asked the Board, since when is consolidation of power a good thing and referred to local municipal amalgamations.

Pat Stallart, Vice President of the Steenburg Lake Community Association, was next to address the Board. He informed the Board that the Steenburg Lake Cottage Association has over two hundred members and has been in existence for fifty-eight years. He stated that he just heard about this proposal a couple of weeks ago and feels there is not enough information in the proposal. He understands the Board's concern over the deterioration of assets and is concerned that the Board is not looking at all the options. He expressed concern over the pace and the lack of details and the Board could make an irreversible decision.

This is the first step towards full amalgamation. It is very unclear what the bottom line of the costs of the service agreement and any savings that would occur would not happen for many years. He reminded the Board that the sale of the administration building would not happen overnight and that they could be faced with paying for expenses associated with an empty building for quite some time. He expressed his concern over the McGeachie Conservation Area, which was donated to the Authority by a former member of the Steenburg Lake Cottage Association. Pat expressed concern that the chronic underfunding of the CVCA could continue even if the Board approved the QC Proposal and he is concerned of the lost jobs and local expertise. Bigger is not necessarily better. Pat thinks that during a flood situation, the CVCA watershed residents will be on a lower priority and will be faced with longer response times. The CVCA Board needs to practice due diligence and look at all the options. The cottage associations are a huge resource to the CVCA and he encouraged the Board to consider forming an advisory council that could include members of these associations.

Ron Gerow responded to Pat saying that the operational part of the proposal is still to be determined and that there will be no degradation of service provided to CVCA watershed residents. Terry Murphy reminded everyone that this is a proposal to provide direction and not an agreement. If the Board decides to continue in this direction, then lawyers will draft an agreement between the two parties. Janice Maynard, QC Chair, stated that the CVCA Board came to them for help and this service agreement is to help a neighbouring Conservation Authority. It has taken a lot of staff time and they want the CVCA Board to give QC direction to get more information with lawyers input. Terry Murphy mentioned that QC has one full time person who is committed to talking to the cottage associations and to attend their meetings and provide them with information.

This service would be provided to the CVCA associations too if the proposal is approved. He also stated that it is his intent to have CVCA staff remain.

Terry Stinson of Algonquin Power introduced himself to the Board. He stated that water is vital to their business and it is not an easy task especially during the summer months. He is pleased with the CVCA water management and stated that he has no opinion on the proposal, but his business depends on prompt, good, local management and thinks that operating from afar may not be a good thing.

Barry Rand stated that all Conservation Authorities have the same priorities and that this Board values their role in the community.

Jim Martin, a former CVCA Board Member from HBM stated that in the past there has been a lack of long term planning for the CVCA and thinks this proposal would take the Authority into the future in a good place.

Bob Ireland, Vice President of the Wollaston Lake Cottage Association and a former CVCA Board Member, was next to address the Board. He stated that lake property owners are large users of the Authorities services. He thinks that there are inconsistencies and incompleteness in the QC Proposal and that the operational components are not defined. When operational components are not defined, agreements tend to fall apart. He reminded the Board that if the proposal is approved the liability still lies with the CVCA Board members. QC Board is a larger Board and the CVCA Board will be out numbered. He is concerned that the level of service provided to the CVCA watershed will change and that CVCA personnel will change. He stated that the savings are not huge in the first three years and after that they are questionable.

A resident of Crowe Lake spoke next. He asked the Board since there are a lot of details to be worked out, will there be any consultation with the cottage associations and if the details are unsatisfactory, can the Board still back out of the proposal or will it be too late then?

Ron Gerow stated that the Board is willing to look at all alternatives and that they are interested in looking at any other options. He thinks the real work is yet to come and that it is imperative to hear any questions or comments during the process. The Board needs to decide to move forward in a general way with the QC Proposal and realize that there will be associated costs. All stakeholders will be informed and be able to express their concerns.

Dave Daunter asked who is on the sub-committee. Barry informed him that the members are Hector Macmillan, Sandy Fraser and Ron Gerow and also reminded the public that all Board Meetings are public.

Pat Stallart asked if it could be formalized with a Board motion to create and advisory council. Barry Rand stated that the Board will be the ones making the

decisions and that outreach initiatives have been discussed. It is the Board's responsibility to keep stakeholders informed.

Dave Daunter asked if there will be a vote today. Barry stated that is up to the Board after their discussion and reminded the public that once there is a motion on the table there can be no other public input. Ron Gerow welcomes all input, as this is a big decision with significant implications for all stakeholders. This Board needs to move forward on the short-term as this process has been going on for several months. Ron states that HBM is the largest stakeholder and has the most to gain or lose. Barry reminded the Board that two board members must leave in fifteen minutes.

BOARD DISCUSSION & CONSIDERATION OF MOTION

Gerald Phillips and Suzanne Partridge need to leave early today. Suzanne asked if the Board has received all written submissions for their review. Barry stated that they have everything. Suzanne stated that she is more concerned of the level of service provided to the CVCA residents then saving a few dollars. She also mentioned that they must have a satellite office if the proposal is accepted.

FA Motion G 76/13

Moved by: Hector Macmillan

Seconded by: Sandy Fraser

That the Full Authority Board take into consideration all of the public comments and concerns and continue to work with Quinte Conservation to develop a detailed services agreement.

Hector Macmillan stated that the public has good ideas and talent that the Board would benefit from moving forward. He also stated that no Board members have been intimidated by anyone. Everyone wants more for less and try to balance the demands of the public is a challenge. He stated that the Northumberland County is now exploring some cost sharing benefits similar to this and while he is not in favour of amalgamation, he is in favour of service agreements.

Barry Rand suggested an amendment to the motion if it was acceptable with the mover and seconder.

FA Motion G 76/13

Moved by: Hector Macmillan

Seconded by: Sandy Fraser

That the Full Authority Board authorizes the Strategic Alternative Sub-committee to take into consideration all public comments and further investigate a detailed service agreement with Quinte Conservation and further that the Strategic

Alternative Sub-committee report back to the Board at the 7 November 2013 Board meeting.

Sharon Carson stated that if the proposal is accepted, she is concerned that the Board will not entertain any other options. She would also like to support CVCA personnel by giving them a full year's notice and feels that CVCA personnel would benefit from having this security.

Bob Stiles stated that the Board worked diligently on the LRP and he can't see moving away from it at this time and supporting a new proposal. He thinks the Board should stay with what has already been approved by the Board and give it a chance.

Suzanne Partridge requested a recorded vote.

Recorded Vote:

Carson, Sharon	No	Partridge, Suzanne	No
Fraser, Sandy	Yes	Phillips, Gerald	No
Gerow, Ron	Yes	Purcell, Dennis	Yes
Goodwin, Brent	No	Rand, Barry	Yes
Macmillan, Hector	Yes	Stiles, Bob	No

Tie Vote.

Motion Lost.

Barry Rand suggested another motion that the Board defer the decision to the next Board meeting.

FA Motion G 77/13

Moved By: Dennis Purcell

Seconded By: Gerald Phillips

That the Board defer the decision on the QC Proposal until the 7 November 2013 Board Meeting.

Ron Gerow stated that the motion is in contradiction to parliamentary procedures and he cannot support this motion. The matter has been resolved. Future discussions could be resurrected by the Board. Hector Macmillan stated that there will be less information at the next meeting, so there is no point in deferring the decision. He feels the Board just threw the whole effort out the window and he guesses they will never know how much money they could have saved. Bob Stiles agrees with Ron it is a defeated issue. Chair Rand ruled the current motion on the table is out of order.

OTHER BUSINESS

None.

NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING

The next scheduled meeting of the Full Authority Board will be 7 November 2013 at 10:00 am.

ADJOURNMENT

FA Motion G 78/13

Moved By: Ron Gerow

Seconded By: Bob Stiles

That the Full Authority Board Meeting be adjourned at 12:00p.m.

Carried.

Amanda Donald
Recording Secretary

Barry Rand
Chair